

**K. Alternatives**

The New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQR) requires a review of alternatives as outlined in the approved scoping document. The alternative plans reviewed are described more fully in Section II. B. Project Description, Alternatives. In addition to the alternative project plans, we prepared a comparison with Alternative Sites and No Action.

**1. Alternative Sites**

The proposed action includes 396 clustered townhomes with significant open space. The Village of Bloomingburg has limited developable land area and no potential undeveloped or underdeveloped sites which could accommodate a similar project. Moving the project to another municipality which is further away from the Village center would not have the ability to positively impact the village economy or the village tax base, nor would it be a benefit in light of the trend to livable, walkable communities.

Proposing the project on another site would not have the described impacts to resources nor any of the project benefits. This preferred project mitigation includes a significant number of community infrastructure improvements as described in Section I. Most significantly, the existing wastewater treatment plant has significant problems and must be replaced by the Village without the assistance of this project which will contribute both the required capacity for the project and the 70,000 gpd capacity needed to be replaced. The Village would need to spend over \$1.5 million or \$10,000 per existing home in the Village to replace the plant. Even with state assistance through low interest financing, without this project paying for the plant replacement, each home owner would likely have an annual sewer bill of approximately \$1,000. The larger plant with additional users will also have significant economies of scale for plant construction and operations and maintenance costs which would not exist without the project in the village.

The impacts to resources would be transferred to the resources present at the alternative site.

**2. Alternative Plans**

Several Alternative Plans were investigated as described in the Project Description, Section II.B. A concept plan was developed in detail for a 395 unit residential development with a mix of single and multi-family units and a 9 hole golf course. A second concept plan labeled the preferred plan in this report was developed with

a 396 unit development of only townhomes without a golf course in a tightly clustered arrangement. Subsequent to plan review comments from the Village Board and their engineer, a Revised Preferred Plan was developed which improves circulation and access for emergency vehicles, reduces impervious area and creates more useable green space as a commons area on the east side of the site and reduces the number of access points on Winterton Road by removing a cluster on the west side of the road at the southerly property boundary.

### 3.1 Golf Course Residential Single Family and Townhome Community

This alternative with a golf course with clubhouse and a mix of single and multi-family units. The following is a review of its impacts.

**Zoning:** The clustered layout meets the PUDR density requirement of 0.5 acre per unit.

**Open Space:** The layout uses the golf course as open space which winds around and between the proposed housing and wetland areas. The open space is less area than the clustered alternative and with golf layout encompasses all parts of the site.

**Visual Impacts:** The project concept includes a golf course and high level of landscaping along the golf course and existing roads which will have an attractive neighborhood appearance when complete.

**Compatibility with neighbors:** The alternative mix of single, and multi-family and golf recreation is compatible with surrounding residential use and adds recreational amenities to the neighborhood through the golf course and trails.

#### Topography and Soils

The land area needed for the golf course required the use of the full extent of the site including the upper areas to the west which are wooded with steeper slopes and 7 wetland crossing which increase the impact potential.

#### Vegetation and Wildlife

As described above under soils the golf course layout requires spread out smaller areas of open space which has higher impact on existing trees and areas adjacent to wetlands on the west side of the site compared to the Cluster Townhome Concept.

#### Drainage and Water

The golf course and single family aspects of this plan require the layout to spread across the site which has a much higher level of state wetland buffer impact and greater impervious area compared to the clustered layout. The layout also impacts more wooded buffer areas on the west side of the site which are mainly avoided in the clustered plan. The plan includes 7 crossings of streams and wetlands compared to the 2 crossings in the clustered plan. With the golf course establishment and maintenance, the turf management plan would need to be carefully developed and implemented to protect water resources.

#### Transportation

Each of the alternative layouts includes the same number of total residential units. This alternative has a higher traffic impact due to the adding single family units which have higher trip projection than multi-family and the trips for the golf course.

#### Water Supply

Each of the alternative layouts include the same number of units. The single family units in this alternative will have higher domestic water use than all multi-family. The most significant difference is the water required for the golf course irrigation usage. Seasonal water withdrawal needs from approximately 104,000 gpd to over 200,000 gpd during the summer months.

#### Wastewater Collection and Treatment

Each of the alternative layouts includes connection to a new Village Treatment Plant which is funded by this project. This alternative including single family would have a slightly higher projected wastewater usage.

#### Community Service and Economic Impacts

The golf course community with single and multi-family family would have a higher assessed value than the all multi-family without golf and would generate greater tax revenue to the taxing bodies. This alternative would generate a higher number of school age children from the single family portion of the project.

#### 2.2 Clustered Townhome Community – Preferred Plan

The preferred plan before revisions includes 396 townhomes without a golf course in a tightly clustered layout with large contiguous open space areas.

**Zoning:** The clustered layout meets the PUDR density requirement of 0.5 acre per unit. Through tight clustering it better meets the intent of the PUDR law.

**Open Space:** The layout has two very large contiguous open space areas on each side of the site. There are smaller open space areas adjacent to the townhome clusters with the largest being 1.5 acre commons area on the east side of the site. In addition to the clubhouse with pool, the open space will include walking trails and the commons will include park type amenities.

**Visual Impacts:** The project proposes a landscaped berm along Winterton Road and a landscaped buffer along the adjoining existing single family residential areas. The visual impact of lighting will be mitigated by selection of full cutoff fixtures with a careful lighting layout.

**Compatibility with neighbors:** The alternative mix of single, and multi-family and golf recreation is compatible with surrounding residential use and adds recreational amenities to the neighborhood through the large open spaces with walking trails.

#### Topography and Soils

The clusters are concentrated on the areas of the site which were previously farmed and have gentle slopes and very little existing vegetation.

#### Vegetation and Wildlife

The clustered layout maximizes buffers along the existing wetlands and along the Shawangunk Kill with a minimum of tree disturbance.

#### Drainage and Water

The plan includes 2 minor stream crossings to access the proposed water tank on the higher western part of the property. The state buffer impact is limited to a crossing on the west side at the narrowest location and use of an open bottom culvert to span the actual wetland. On the east side the only impact is for a storm water basin serving the clubhouse area. This existing buffer is entirely existing hay field and no trees will be impacted by the proposed vegetated basin.

#### Transportation

Each of the alternative layouts includes the same number of total residential units. This alternative without golf course and all multi-family units has less projected trips. The site design includes bus drop off areas for school bus safety and a walkway system facilitates pedestrian travel throughout the site.

#### Water Supply

Each of the alternative layouts include the same number of units. This alternative without golf course has significantly less total water demand.

#### Wastewater Collection and Treatment

Each of the alternative layouts includes connection to a new Village Treatment Plant which is funded by this project. With all multi-family the wastewater usage is slightly less than the alternative with single family.

#### Community Service and Economic Impacts

This alternative would have a lower total assessed value than the golf course community with single and multi-family family and would generate greater tax revenue to the taxing bodies. This alternative would generate a lower number of school age children from the single family portion of the project.

### 3.2 Clustered Townhome Community - Revised Preferred Plan

The Revised Clustered single family plan is a refinement of the Preferred Concept Plan that resulted from Village Board and Village Engineer input. The result is the same number of units of the same type with 2 acres less impervious area, better emergency vehicle access, more contiguous open space on the west side of the site and an added 1.5 acre Village Commons park type green area in the center of the east side of the site.

### 4.No Action

The no action alternative would continue the current situation, which is a farm with hay fields located about ½ mile from the Village center. Farming the site continues current impact on water quality based on the need to till and fertilize the fields.

Not completing the project would be significantly worse financially for the existing Village residents due to the existing requirement to replace the treatment plant without the construction financial assistance from this project and without the added tax base for the town and added rate payer base for the sewer system operations.

The following table is a comparison of the impacts of the alternatives:

ALTERNATIVE IMPACT COMPARISON SUMMARY				
Area of Concern	"No-Action "**	Alternate Layout	Preferred Layout	Revised Preferred Layout
<b>Developed Area</b>				
Residential Units	0	395	396	396
Impervious Surfaces (Acres)	4	32.9	26	24
Landscaped Areas/Lawns (Acres)**	0	20	15.7	17.7
Water Quality Basins	0	7	7	7
<b>Open Space Resources</b>				
Agricultural	113.3	0	0	0
Meadow or Brushland (Non-agricultural)	6.3	90.4	86.6	86.6
Forested (Upland)	22.9	0	17.3	17.3
<b>Natural Resources</b>				
NYSDEC Regulated Wetlands(Acres)	40.3	40.3	40.3	40.3
NYSDEC 100' Buffer Impact (Acres)	0	3.2	0.9	0.9
Federal (ACOE) Wetlands(Acres)	11.1	11.1	11.1	11.1
Composite Wetlands*** (Acres)	51.4	51.4	51.4	51.4
Wetland/Stream crossings	0	5	2	2
<b>Community Resources</b>				
Population	0	913	812	812
Water Demand (gpd)	0	113,805	106,230	106,230
Sewage Demand (gpd)	0	120,000	110,000	110,000
School-age Children	N/A	211	110	110
Net Revenues to School District	0	(501,491)	498,459	498,459
<b>Traffic</b>				
Residential Access Points	Winterton Road- 2 access points	Winterton Road- 7access points	Winterton Road- 6 access points	Winterton Road- 7 access points
Trip Generation (AM Peak Hour/PM Peak Hour)	0	255/328	174/205	174/205
* Equivalent to existing conditions ** Lawn includes golf fairways in alternate layout scenario *** Composite wetlands are a combination of ACOE and NYSDEC regulated areas				

**L. Potential Growth Inducing Aspects**

There are potential growth producing aspects of the project, but none that are significant. Throughout this DEIS it has been discussed that 396 new residential townhomes will be constructed. This is likely to bring a permanent population increase of 810 people to the Village of Bloomingburg.

During construction there will be temporary employment created. Some of those employed may be coming from outside the immediate surroundings. There is likely to be a short term growth associated with the local increased spending on the project materials, spending on local labor and the effects of outside laborers purchasing goods and services within the community. It is expected that this economic activity will not be permanent. It is not expected that this activity will result in any demand for housing.

The establishment of the new Villages of Chestnut Ridge will provide a permanent increase in wages and income to the locale. It is expected that this income will have a multiplier effect on the local economy. However, the order of magnitude of the development is not expected to produce any substantial establishment of new commercial entities. It is expected that the existing local economy will absorb the economic activity utilizing existing businesses and existing underutilized capacity.

No adverse effects are expected in the short term or long term from the project with respect to growth inducement. Except as outlined with the repairs to the wastewater treatment plant, there will be no significant effect on existing utility system capacity. No major roadway improvements are planned as a part of the project which would trigger changes in transportation access to the area.